APPROVED

Environmental Charter Schools

Minutes

Audit Committee Meeting

By Teleconference/Zoom

Date and Time
Wednesday March 6, 2024 at 1:00 PM

Location
Video call link: https://meet.google.com/qdu-ziwk-fkq

Alternative access:

- Two-way Teleconference Location: 2625 Manhattan Beach Blvd, Suite 100, Redondo Beach, CA 90278
- Dial-In Only: (US) +1 234-755-2238 PIN: 425 801 609#

Audit Committee Members
Mr. Anthony Jowid - Chair
Mr. Kennedy Hilario
Dr. Madhu Chatwani

Audit Committee Charter

- Recommend appointment, retention and termination of the independent auditor to the Board on an annual basis or at the end of a multi-year agreement;
- Review and discuss with the independent auditor any material risks and weaknesses in internal controls identified by the auditor and the adequacy of ECS's accounting and financial reporting processes. Solicit recommendations from the independent auditor for

---

the improvement of ECS's internal control procedures and particular areas where new or more detailed controls or procedures are desirable;
- Resolve any disagreements between management and the auditor regarding financial reporting and other matters;
- Pre-approve all auditing and non-audit services performed by auditors.

THE ORDER OF BUSINESS MAY BE CHANGED WITHOUT NOTICE

Notice is hereby given that the order of consideration of matters on this agenda may be changed without prior notice.

PUBLIC SPEAKERS AT STANDING COMMITTEE MEETINGS

Notice is hereby given that consistent with the requirements of the Ralph M. Brown Act, special presentations not mentioned in the agenda may be made at this meeting. However, any such presentation will be for information only. The public should be aware that the Committee is unable by law to deliberate or take action on items raised during the Presentations from the Floor section.

Environmental Charter Schools recognizes that it benefits greatly from public input and perspective. Individuals are invited to address the Committee on any topic or subject matter that falls within the Committee's purview. Speakers may sign up in person immediately prior to the beginning of the Committee meeting by speaking with the Committee Chair.

Should a member of the public wish to speak on matters not listed on the agenda, they may speak during the Presentations from the Floor section of the agenda. Speakers will be given a maximum of three (3) minutes each to address the Committee (non-English speakers utilizing translators will be given a maximum of six (6) minutes each). Please note that the Committee allows a maximum of 10 minutes to each subject as determined by the Committee Chair.

Should a member of the public wish to speak on matters listed on the agenda, they may speak during the Presentations from the Floor section of the agenda. Speakers will be given a maximum of five (5) minutes each to address the Committee (non-English speakers utilizing translators will be given a maximum of ten (10) minutes each).

The public should be aware that the Committee is unable by law to deliberate or take action on items raised during the Presentations from the Floor section.

REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION WILL BE PROVIDED FOR ANY INDIVIDUAL WITH A DISABILITY

Pursuant to the Rehabilitation Act of 1973 and the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, any individual with a disability who requires reasonable accommodation to attend or participate in this meeting of the Governing Board may request assistance by contacting ECS at (310) 214-3408, option 5.

FOR MORE INFORMATION
For more information concerning this agenda or for materials relating to this meeting, please contact ECS at (310) 214-3408, option 5.

Committee Members Present
Anthony Jowid (remote), Dr. Madhu Chatwani (remote), Kennedy Hilario (remote)

Committee Members Absent
None

Guests Present
Farnaz Golshani-Flechner (remote), Jeremiah Rosario David (remote), Tracy Bondi (remote)

I. Opening Items

A. Record Attendance

B. Call the Meeting to Order

Anthony Jowid called a meeting of the Audit Committee of Environmental Charter Schools to order on Wednesday Mar 6, 2024 at 1:05 PM.

C. Approve Agenda

Kennedy Hilario made a motion to approve agenda.
Dr. Madhu Chatwani seconded the motion.
The committee **VOTED** unanimously to approve the motion.

Roll Call

Anthony Jowid	Aye
Kennedy Hilario	Aye
Dr. Madhu Chatwani	Aye

II. Presentations from the Floor

A. Presentation from the floor on non agenda items

None.

B. Presentations from the floor on agenda items

None.

III. Discussion Items / Updates

A. Audit Bid Review/Discussion

Director of Finance Tracy Bondi and Director of Compliance & Operations Jeremiah David presented:

Based on the scoring in the ECS & MCP - Audit Bid Evaluation Matrix, the Christy White proposal on rated the highest across all proposals. The criteria used were:

- **Proposal Completeness** = how thorough the proposal's information is toward meeting audit and tax services needs
- **Vendor Information / References** = information within or outside the proposal on the auditor's company background, operational and financial health, etc.
- **Prior Relevant Experience** = information within or outside the proposal that indicates the auditor's experience working with K-12 public school/charter school clients.
- **Costs** = annual costs as stated in the proposal
- **Demonstrated Quality of Work** = information within or outside the proposal on the auditor's actual or demonstrable work product

The Audit Committee reviewed the proposal scoring and ultimately decided for the ECS staff recommendation to move forward with the Christy White proposal.

IV. Action Item

A. Recommend Board Approval of Auditor Contract/Proposal

Dr. Madhu Chatwani made a motion to recommend board approval of auditor contract/proposal from Christy White.
Anthony Jowid seconded the motion.
The committee **VOTED** unanimously to approve the motion.

Roll Call

Dr. Madhu Chatwani	Aye
Anthony Jowid	Aye
Kennedy Hilario	Aye

V. Closing Items

A. Adjourn Meeting

Dr. Madhu Chatwani made a motion to adjourn meeting.
Kennedy Hilario seconded the motion.
The committee **VOTED** unanimously to approve the motion.

Roll Call

Anthony Jowid	Aye
Dr. Madhu Chatwani	Aye

Roll Call

Kennedy Hilario Aye

There being no further business to be transacted, and upon motion duly made, seconded and approved, the meeting was adjourned at 1:17 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,
Anthony Jowid